

Challenging Humanitarian Images the Case of Anti-Trafficking

Anelynda Mielke

Abstract—Humanitarian efforts have spurred a visual culture that portrays suffering victims in order to elicit concern in audiences across the world. The humanitarian efforts of Western nations have come under considerable scrutiny in recent years. This paper analyzes the response of a sex workers organization in the Asia-Pacific region to the efforts of anti-human trafficking activists. It focuses on two visual images that are used to challenge this humanitarian regime and situates this campaign within the context of other humanitarian criticism.

Index Terms—Asia-Pacific region, humanitarianism, human trafficking, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), visual culture.

I. INTRODUCTION

On May 8 2014, The Huffington Post ran an article by Jumoke Balogun that responded to the “Bring Back Our Girls” Campaign [1]. For several days, this Campaign had urged Western powers to intervene on behalf of over 200 Nigerian girls kidnapped by the militant Islamist group Boko Haram. The article opposed this cause and urged Americans to support Nigerian activists in their quest to democratically pressure Nigeria’s Jonathan Administration instead of supporting the expansion of American military power in the region. Balogun states in her article:

“You might not know this, but the United States military loves your hashtags because it gives them legitimacy to encroach and grow their military presence in Africa. AFRICOM (United States Africa Command), the military body that is responsible for overseeing U.S. military operations across Africa, gained much from #KONY2012 and will now gain even more from #BringBackOurGirls” [1].

Balogun enumerates the problems that arise when humanitarian aims lend support to military advancement. This is a chastising not of the humanitarian aim (Balogun is encouraged by Americans’ concern over the kidnappings), but of its effects. Her warning follows that of other critics cautioning humanitarians about the effects of their well-intentioned actions.

Dambisa Moyo’s (2003) *Dead Aid* [2] and William Easterly’s (2007) *The White Man’s Burden* [3] are prominent frontrunners in the critique of foreign aid to ‘underdeveloped’ countries. Moyo and Easterly present the problems with Western countries’ efforts to help. They point to flaws in the system of aid and oppose the dependency

fueled by the aid industry. Other examples of critiques against the humanitarian machine include a 2013 *Slate* article that addressed Americans’ attempts to ‘help’ after Typhoon Haiyan ravaged the Philippines. The article informed well-wishing Westerners that their paraphernalia was often referred to by aid workers on the ground by a particular acronym, “S.W.E.D.O.W., or, Stuff We Don’t Want” [4]. Although they address different situations, these writers all caution humanitarians about the unintended effects of their actions. They also point to a great military and/ or financial structure that thrives on the victimhood of the majority world. The latter relationship (thriving on victimhood) has been heavily theorized and demonstrated by scholars of World Systems Theories and Dependency Theories.

This article does not focus on those critiques, but rather seeks to shed light on the question of humanitarian *intention*. The importance of sympathy and sensitivity as attributes of humanness that carry moral value stems from developments in the 18th century [5]. In the decades and centuries since then, humanitarian sentiment has perpetuated vast campaigns to help victims in distress. The seemingly obvious morality of humanitarian action supports a vast roving aid machine comprised of millions of Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) and Government Agencies rushing to help all manner of victims (displaced persons, malnourished children, youth at risk, victims of human trafficking, etc.). Technical advancements in photography and film have led to the increased proliferation of images of the victim, designed to elicit a concerned response in their audience. The prevalence of images of suffering is so widespread that ignorance about the suffering of others can be seen as morally depraved, as something that is inexcusable after a certain point in one’s life [6].

Increasingly complex causal chains link distant victims with perpetrators that are far removed geographically [5], [6]. The responsibility for both causing and addressing distant suffering is cast onto the shoulders of Western countries. The latter responsibility - for aiding the victims - is assumed by ‘helpers’ even if victims have not requested help. Sontag (2003) writes that “the national consensus on American history as a history of progress....focuses our attention on wrongs, both here and elsewhere, for which America sees itself as the solution or cure” [6]. In other words, representatives of Western nations provide active help because they see themselves as humanitarian actors that are fulfilling a vital role. As demonstrated in the introduction, this role might be designed with the best of intentions but could nevertheless be less than helpful to the recipients of aid.

Manuscript received June 23, 2014; revised August 26, 2014

Anelynda Mielke is with the Carleton University, Canada (e-mail: anelynda@gmail.com).

II. SHOWING THE VICTIM

The international humanitarian system uses an array of images that portray suffering victims and 'recovered' or 'helped' beneficiaries of aid and rehabilitation programs. This is not unlike 'before' and 'after' images used to promote a dietary supplement for weight loss. Sontag (2003) notes that in the news media of the 1930s, when war photography began to be widely circulated, "editorial" images differed substantially from the style used in "advertising." This is no longer the case in contemporary visual culture, where suffering and advertising styles of photography have become more similar and overlapping in style [6]. Thus a particular form of branding is used by organizations of varying sizes to represent many different types of victimhood. And what else is to be expected in today's consumer-driven age? The public responds to this kind of advertising in other sectors; the humanitarian sector logically uses these familiar tactics to reach out to concerned and compassionate donors and supporters.

III. 'PALERMO PROTOCOL' TO 'SEX WORK AND THE LAW'

In 2000, the United Nations General Assembly passed the *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children*, a Protocol to the *United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime*. This document is also known as the *Palermo Protocol* [7]. The Palermo Protocol spurred and supported the already-rapidly expanding anti-trafficking movement. This movement is led by the United Nations, the United States and international coalitions, with significant contributions from other countries.¹ The major focus of anti-trafficking² interventions was and continues to be red-light districts and other areas in countries of the global South, especially South and Southeast Asia. Sex workers have reacted to the fact that the explosion of anti-trafficking activity often lacks their input. This prompted a manager of the United Nations Project on Human Trafficking for one region of Southeast Asia, Phil Marshall, to comment, "I've never seen an issue where there is less interest in hearing from those who are most affected by it" [8].³ Research has indicated that sex workers feel they are

¹Soderland (2005) notes that this campaign began in the mid-1980s, when increased attention was focused on women's sexual and reproductive rights and media began to increasingly highlight the struggle of victims of sex trafficking [19].

²From this point on, 'human trafficking' and 'trafficking' will be used interchangeably. The term 'trafficking' can be assumed to mean trafficking in human beings, unless otherwise specified. The author understands that human trafficking for the sex trade is over-emphasized, according to many scholars, leading to neglect of other forms of trafficking, an oversight that is perceptible in the text of the Palermo Protocol [12]. However, for the context of this article, human trafficking for the sex trade is specifically and exclusively discussed, and therefore these terms will be used interchangeably.

³This has occurred despite the fact that the anti-trafficking movement has lacked overall input from sex workers, even while its moral thrust led to funding cuts for programs that benefit them. USAID claimed that it would stop funding groups that support legalization of sex work. The increased attention to trafficking eroded institutional partnerships between the U.S. State Department and groups that worked toward decriminalization of the sex trade or harm reduction. Advocates of such views were charged with not taking the phenomenon of global human trafficking seriously enough, and were threatened with accusations of being supporters of "child prostitution" or "child molesters" [19].

exploited as increased attention is brought to brothels and red-light areas of the global South. One participant (2008) in an Indian ethnographic study conducted in Kolkata's ancient Sonagachi and Kalighat districts, told researchers:

"It is true that over the years there have been so many non-governmental organizations [NGOs], so many research scholars who have come to us, so many of us have been interviewed for films and others. But we have not gained out of any of these.... It is the people who have interviewed us, photographed or filmed us who have gained" [9].

This comment from an Indian sex worker corroborates Marshall's claim that there is a lack of consultation with sex workers by NGOs and policymakers seeking to eradicate human trafficking. Advocates' early assessments of the Palermo Protocol drafting process in Vienna similarly expressed fear that sex workers would be negatively impacted by increased attention to anti-trafficking efforts [10]. The fever-pitched frenzy to eradicate human trafficking has brought greater focus to the sex work sphere. Observers in the policy arena and sex workers both note that early humanitarian impulses have negatively impacted some communities.

A recent sea change in international humanitarian efforts to curb the threat of human trafficking is best evidenced in a second report produced by the United Nations. In October 2012, the United Nations Development Program (UNDP) published the *Sex Work and the Law in Asia and the Pacific Report*, which advocated for the decriminalization of sex work in many parts of the world [11]. The *Sex Work and the Law Report* highlights negative ways in which anti-trafficking interventions are perceived by sex workers [11], [12]. It states that, "forced rescue and rehabilitation practices lower sex workers' control over where and under what conditions they sell sexual services and to whom, exposing them to greater violence and exploitation" [11]. Sex workers' access to legal, social and health resources suffer through the use of aggressive 'raid' and 'rescue' tactics staged by NGOs in collaboration with local law enforcement agencies [11]. The freedom to come together, communicate, organize, and advocate for rights is central to sex workers' ability to fight stigma, remain healthy, and improve their self-confidence [9]. Furthermore, several South and Southeast Asian sex workers' rights unions and organizations were involved in drafting the 2012 report, indicating an attempt to remedy the lack of sex workers' perspectives in the anti-trafficking debate.⁴

IV. HUMAN TRAFFICKING AS SPECTACLE

Aggressive advertisements and information campaigns

⁴Kay Warren (2007) finds that the 2000 UN Palermo Protocol on trafficking emphasizes emigration reform and border policing, which criminalizes the traffickers and victims, while trying to keep both these groups outside the boundaries of sovereign states [12]. The increased attention on regulation of borders coincides with a mandate that polices women's sexuality along with their freedom of motion. Sex work is not recognized as work; it is thought to be denigrating and damaging to women [30] [9]; [21]. Anti-trafficking campaigns often hold this to be self-evident, and feel that since sex work cannot be a choice (since no woman would choose her own oppression), women must be rescued from the trade [10], [18].

have portrayed suffering victims of human trafficking since the 1990s. Rutvica Andrijasevic (2007) analyzes early images used in Eastern European anti- trafficking campaigns of the International Organization for Migration (IOM) in the late-1990s and early 2000s [13]. Nameless female bodies -and sometimes only body parts - are portrayed in the campaigns. Migration for women is equated with risk and even certainty of being trafficked into the sex trade, undermining women's experiences as migrants. Such portrayals, though they were no doubt well-intentioned, can have deleterious effects for women's mobility and freedom. Women are subtly encouraged to remain within the 'safe' domain of the home, whether this is interpreted to mean the home country or the domestic sphere.

Sex workers' rights activists oppose these campaigns, which suppress women's freedom of movement and migration. They protest the stigma that these campaigns promulgate, as well as the tangible, negative effects that anti-trafficking tactics (such as raids and rescue operations) have on sex workers. Fig. 1, below, is used by the Asia Pacific Network of Sex Workers (APNSW) to protest the 'rescue' or 'raid' tactics used by NGOs and local law enforcement authorities in their attempts to extract victims of human trafficking from brothels [15].



Fig. 1. "No raids, no rescues" source: Asia pacific network of sex workers [14].

In a 'rescue operation,' or a 'raid,'⁵ an NGO will collaborate with local police to enter a brothel in a surprise encounter with supposed traffickers, madams or brothel owners thought to be harbouring migrants forced into the sex trade. Three examples of rescues or raids bear mentioning. Nicholas Kristof (2011) of the New York Times discusses the brothel raid that led to the rescue of Somaly Mam, now a well-known human rights activist with her own anti-trafficking foundation. In his column, he defends the practice of raiding brothels [16]. Reporter Maggie Jones (2003) describes a similar raid in a bar called the Pink Lady in Chiang Mai, Thailand. Undercover investigators gathered intelligence in the brothel for months before a case was built and the police were involved to conduct the operation [17]. A third example is found in a rescue operation that occurred in Svay Pak, Cambodia, which was featured in a 2004 episode of Dateline NBC. In this operation, 37 suspected victims of trafficking – some of them young children – were removed from a Cambodian brothel area in a massive effort involving

⁵ Those who view themselves as 'rescuers' prefer the term 'rescue' or 'rescue operation' (these are predominantly NGO representatives and law enforcement agents). The term 'raid' was formerly used by some organizations, but was more recently replaced by the more palatable, gentler term 'rescue.'

Cambodian police, NGO investigators and a media team [18]. This situation in Cambodia is not unique as sex workers are often forcibly removed from brothels, dance bars and clubs in these operations, and might be locked in 'rehabilitative' homes where they are not allowed to leave, post-rescue [17]. The noble intentions and honest efforts of many activists involved in these anti- trafficking campaigns unfortunately lead to unintended consequences for sex workers, denying their agency and compromising their well-being.

Fig. 1 poignantly summarizes the Asia Pacific Network of Sex Workers (APNSW)'s⁶ response to rescue operations or raids performed by NGOs and local government authorities.⁷ The image depicts at least four figures in the back of a pickup truck (they appear to be women), being guarded by at least three male military or police officers in uniform, one of which is carrying a large gun. A few onlookers appear to be gathered around. The entire image is crossed out with a red line, and features the words "No Raids, No Rescues" written in bold letters around it in a circle. The police or military personnel guarding the vehicle appear to be male. It should be noted that the 'rescued' women are unarmed, and under the control of the 'rescuers.' If these women were dangerous criminals, the treatment shown in this picture would likely not differ much from what is depicted here. Without understanding some of the context surrounding this image, it would be impossible to tell whether the individuals in the truck are criminals or victims of a crime.

The idea of ambiguity around the status of the women in the truck (are they criminals or victims?) coincides with Soderland's (2005) findings that the anti-trafficking movement is motivated by a moral ideology that seeks to regulate women's bodies, going so far as to "police non-procreative sex on a global level" [19]. This means that, regardless of their victimhood or criminal status, women's bodies warrant control by the state. Regardless of whether they are victims or criminals, these women are 'problematic' because of their apparent involvement in the sex trade. The male police officers guarding the women in the truck with their guns are representatives of what Soderland (2005) sees as the "masculinist state" that attempts to protect verifiable victims (those whose innocence is clearly established) [19]. This masculine state is similarly seen controlling the movements of migrant women and policing their sexual agency. Women's agency is not acknowledged by such a state, where gendered victims need to be protected, rather than being given positive human rights [12], [19], [21].

These notions are corroborated with Warren's (2007) reflections on the drafting of the Palermo Protocol, where a criminalization and legal framework become predominant over a more positive human rights-based perspective [12]. The Palermo Protocol was compiled in the United Nations

⁶ While sex workers' experiences are obviously vastly diverse, the APNSW is comprised of members of this population that speak from sex workers' perspectives in the Asia-Pacific region. Therefore, while the movement obviously cannot speak for all sex workers, it is putting forth a collective voice that offers dissent in the face of the damaging effects of anti-trafficking campaigns in the region.

⁷ The APNSW also highlights the raid/rescue operation from sex workers' perspectives through a music video called "Somaly Uh-Uh." The video features Barbie dolls experiencing a rescue operation, and is set to Lady Gaga's song "Bad Romance" [31].

Centre for International Crime Prevention in Vienna, and was an add-on to a global framework against transnational organized crime, indicating a criminal focus within the UN-mandated attempt to control international human trafficking. It contains an emphasis on keeping traffickers and victims out of the boundaries drawn by nations' sovereign borders [13]. The 'problem'⁸ of trafficking – thought to encompass the victims, traffickers and migrants more generally – is to be kept out of sovereign borders through heavy policing.⁹ In this characterization, the lines between criminal, victim, migrant, and sex worker are blurred and any of these parties can be viable targets for anti-trafficking interventions. The ambiguous nature of distinctions between traffickers and victims is illustrated in Fig. 1. This ambiguity serves to underline the APNSW's perspective and apparent goal in rendering the image.

Furthermore, Fig. 1 challenges accepted definitions of 'victimhood.' Anti-trafficking efforts often portray women like those in the truck as 'victims' of the sex trade, who will be grateful for rescue [16], [18], [20]. Ronald Weitzer (2007) notes that in many moral crusades, "Casting the problem in highly dramatic terms by recounting the plight of highly traumatized victims is intended to alarm the public and policy makers and justify draconian solutions" [21]. The victims in anti-trafficking campaigns are painted as helpless and in need of rescue by (often foreign) forces. The dramatized details of their plight are recounted on anti-trafficking websites and in public awareness campaigns, where the inevitability of their demise is made obvious [13]. Thus, any means necessary can be used in order to rescue these helpless victims, even what are called 'draconian measures' by Weitzer (2007) [21]. From the perspective of sex workers that is communicated in Fig. 1, raids or rescue operations arguably fit this 'draconian' category.

Jo Doezema (2005) asserts that, "In the myth of trafficking in women, structured around the figure of the passive and unknowing innocent, the active, aware 'sex worker' disappears" [10]. The women in Fig. 1, viewed through the eyes of authorities and NGO representatives interested in rescuing them, are simply victims. It is not necessary to ask for their opinion regarding rescue, or to consider the effects of the raid on their lives. They fit the profile of 'victim' and are therefore eligible for 'rescue,' without asking further questions. The APNSW claims the image of the victim, whose message is obvious to anti-trafficking activists, and offers a dissenting view. Theirs is an attempt to recognize the "active, aware sex worker" in the frame of an image previously seen to represent only helpless victims. Instead of hearing from the rescuers (the military or police agents standing in front of the truck, or the foreign NGOs and governments that support them), the viewer of Fig. 1 is forced to hear an opinion from the 'rescued victims' (the women inside the truck). The viewer is forced, through the words inscribed near the image, to entertain the possibility

that these women might not consent to their own rescue.

In sum, Fig. 1 represents APNSW's retaliation against the negative effects of the anti-trafficking movement. The image shows rejection of a masculinist state that polices women's bodies. It contests the deeper entrenchment of sovereign borders that limit migrant women's mobility. It rejects the anti-trafficking movement's blurring of the lines between victims, traffickers and criminals, all of which are conflated into one category and subject to strict law enforcement measures. Some sex workers reject what they see as 'draconian measures' justified by the exaggerated claims that some humanitarians make. The APNSW, representing sex workers' rights, retaliates by pointing out how sex workers experience anti-human trafficking campaigns. In so doing, the organization demands recognition of the perspectives and agency possessed by the workers affected by rescues, raids and anti-trafficking campaigns.

V. THE REHABILITATION PROBLEM

The problem facing rehabilitation attempts is that a high number of the rescued 'survivors' seem to be unwilling. A review of the aftermath of the previously mentioned brothel raids illustrates this point. A year after having purchased two girls from a brothel in Poipet, New York Times writer Nicholas Kristof (2005) (who also wrote about Somaly Mam's brothel raid) returned to the area. He found that one of the two girls rescued had escaped the shelter home and was back in her former brothel [22]. Within a week of the raids on Svay Pak's brothels in Phnom Penh, six of the 37 rescued victims had escaped from the shelter where they were placed post-rescue [19].

In Thailand, 24 of the 43 rescued in the raid on the Pink Lady escaped post-rescue attempts to rehabilitate them. 11 of them escaped in a somewhat dramatic fashion: they tied bed sheets together to exit the second-floor window and then climbed over a barrier made of concrete and wire that surrounded the orphanage where they were being held. In another escape attempt, a woman was hospitalized after falling from a window on the second floor [8]. These dramatic escapes indicate a strong desire to leave the rehabilitation facility (in some cases strong enough to risk injury). A staff person in charge of the shelter where the rescued victims from Svay Pak were taken claimed that 40% of those brought to the shelter return to the sex trade [8]. A Kolkata-based anti-trafficking activist (2013) similarly admits: "successful rehabilitations are very rare" [24].

The dismal conditions within 'rehabilitative' homes are exemplified by a situation that came to light in India in the fall of 2012. In Mumbai, 23 women and girls ran away from a Government-run shelter home in the Mankhurd area over the span of approximately one month in 2012. The women being kept in this home had largely been removed from the sex trade. Conditions in the home, which were revealed by its former inhabitants after the women escaped, were bad enough to warrant a High Court¹⁰ inquiry into the home's environment [25]. Accounts of rape perpetrated by men visiting the home, inadequate food and water, and lack of

⁸Weitzer (2007) notes that while purveyors of moral crusades try to emphasize the legitimacy of their exaggerated claims without compromise, these movements are actually creating a 'problem' using their rhetoric [21]. This is done even while claiming that their claims are self-evident.

⁹Domestic connections with trafficking, within a nation's police structure or criminal networks, are downplayed [12].

¹⁰The High Court is the State of Maharashtra's highest legal authority.

cleanliness and hygiene painted a bleak picture of suffering for its more than 250 inhabitants. Furthermore, the media refer to the women staying in such homes as ‘inmates’ [26]. This title conveys a lack of distinction between the women and criminals warranting confinement. It is little wonder that women and girls removed from the sex trade would want to flee shelters such as the one described in Mumbai. What is conveyed in such accounts of escape is that post-rescue activities of anti-trafficking NGOs are not seen as positive or rehabilitative by those experiencing rehabilitation.

Further problems arise when women and girls are presented with opportunities for job-skills training that they do not perceive as helpful. Rescued victims undergoing rehabilitation are often taught a vocational skill such as sewing.¹¹ As a response to these rehabilitation attempts, the APNSW offers the message contained in Fig. 2.



Fig. 2. “Don’t talk to me...” source: Asia Pacific Network of Sex Workers [23].

Fig. 2 features a sewing machine drawn in black and white ink inside a red circle with a strike through it and the words “Don’t talk to me about sewing machines. Talk to me about workers rights” recorded around the image [23]. It is difficult to overlook the obvious connotations associated with sewing machines, which indicate acquisition of a domestic, stereotypically “feminine” skill. The parallel might not carry over entirely, as tailors are sought-after, highly skilled professionals and in-demand businessmen in many parts of the global South or majority world. The historical association with a maternal role and confinement within the realm of the home, or the domestic sphere, could be latently present within the mindset of NGOs based in the global North, however. Anti-trafficking NGOs might conceive of this simple, useful craft as a viable and ‘safe’ employment alternative to life in a brothel but the APNSW obviously disagrees. Fig. 2 portrays APNSW’s sentiments regarding these rehabilitation attempts of anti-trafficking NGOs. Some efforts can seem forced for the recipients being trained. The image sends the message to these NGOs that they are not knowledgeable about sex workers’ needs or desires.

Fig. 2 can be read as a rejection of the false consciousness theory, often advanced by anti-trafficking NGOs to legitimate their tactics.¹² Soderland (2005) explains that the idea of sex workers’ false consciousness has a long history,

and “continues to be evoked with equal enthusiasm today as a paradigm-saving technique, one that encourages activists to dodge potential pitfalls in their own interventionist strategies” [19]. The false consciousness idea claims that sex workers need rescue and rehabilitation, regardless of whether they see themselves as consenting to sexual acts or not. Some neo-abolitionist¹³ groups that were heavily involved in the drafting of the Palermo Protocol promote such a view. Refusing the term ‘sex work,’ these group sees all ‘prostitution’ as dehumanizing, and therefore conclude that individuals who self-identify as sex workers and do not want to leave their jobs should be prevented from consenting to their own dehumanization [10]. APNSW’s reaction to such a view is summarized in Fig. 2.

Some research has shown that when sex workers’ knowledge is valued, they can unite to defend their rights and ameliorate the networks they belong to and their communities by extension. Many community members in Kolkata were doubtful that sex workers could run a project to better their living situations and assert their rights. Despite these doubts, the Durbar Mahila Samnwaya Committee (DMSC) – a collective of 65,000 sex workers in Kolkata – successfully runs HIV/AIDS programs in the community. It also has a banking system, called *Usha*. This program protects sex workers from profiteering moneylenders that will trap them with exorbitant interest rates [9], [27]. A sex worker from Sonagachi (2008) involved in a study described the self-sufficient attitude that provided the basis for these successful mobilization attempts. She said, “If we have to take any decision or resolve any issue, we will do that ourselves. We might make mistakes. But still we will do it on our own....Let there be mistakes. We will solve our mistakes too. But we will not take decisions based on your logic” [9]. This reflects a staunch defense of sex workers’ knowledge and abilities to make decisions that concern their communities, while rejecting claims from outsiders who say that they know what is best for sex workers.

The messages promoted in Images 1 and 2 by the APNSW reject the idea that humanitarians always know what is best for ‘victims’ outside their own context. The APNSW wants to assert sex workers as knowledgeable about their needs, rights, environment, and the sector in which they work. The organization uses the best arsenal of the anti-trafficking movement - visa portrayal of victimhood and rehabilitation successes - to show humanitarians in this sector how they have missed the mark.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

A. Mielke would like to acknowledge the input and advice of many professors at Carleton University in Ottawa, Canada that helped guide her thought processes and reflections on this topic. She is especially grateful for Dr. Doris Buss’s Graduate Class in Feminism and the Law (where she started to form the ideas expressed in this paper) and for Dr. William Walters’ guidance as her supervisor. She

¹¹ Examples can be found on the websites of organizations like Not For Sale and New Light.

¹² Image 1 also rejects this theory, but the message against such a paradigm is especially pronounced in Image 2.

¹³ This term can be taken to refer to groups that wish to abolish the sex trade entirely or to those that want to abolish human trafficking. These terms can be conflated in confusing ways at times, both by the activists themselves and by their critics.

has also benefited greatly from discussions with her colleague Zoey Jones (PhD Candidate at Carleton University, Ottawa, Canada) on feminism, the media and the portrayal of sex work.

REFERENCES

- [1] B. Jamoke, "Dear Americans, your hashtags won't #bring back our girls, your might actually be making things worse," *Huffington Post*, 8 May 2014.
- [2] D. Moyo, *Dead Aid: Why Aid is Not Working and How There is a Better Way for Africa*, New York: Douglas and McIntyre, 2003.
- [3] W. Easterly, *The White Man's Burden*, New York: Penguin Books, 2007.
- [4] J. Alexander, "Please don't send your old shoes to the Philippines: survivors of typhoon haiyan need your help, but send money, not your hand-me-downs," *Slate*, 11 Nov. 2013.
- [5] L. Boltanski, *Distant Suffering: Morality, Media, Politics*, New York: Cambridge University Press, 1999.
- [6] S. Sontag, *Regarding the Pain of Others*, New York: Picador, 2003.
- [7] United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC), "Protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in persons, especially women and children," *Supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime*, 2000.
- [8] M. Jones, "Thailand's brothel busters," *Mother Jones*, Nov.-Dec. 2003.
- [9] A. Basu and M. J. Dutta, "Participatory change in a campaign led by sex workers: connecting resistance to action-oriented agency," *Qualitative Health Research*, vol. 18, no.1, pp. 106-119, 2008.
- [10] J. Doezema, "Now you see her, now you don't: sex workers at the UN trafficking protocol negotiation," *Social Legal Studies*, vol. 14, no. 61, pp. 61-89, 2005.
- [11] United Nations Development Program (UNDP), *Sex Work and the Law in Asia and the Pacific*, 2012.
- [12] K. Warren, "The 2000 UN human trafficking protocol: rights, enforcement, vulnerabilities," *The Practice of Human Rights: Tracking Law between the Global and the Local*, Edited by Mark Goodale and Sally Engle Merry, New York: Cambridge University Press, pp. 242-269, 2007.
- [13] R. Andrijasevic, "Beautiful dead bodies: gender, migration and representation in anti-trafficking campaigns," *Feminist Review*, vol. 86, pp. 24-44, 2007.
- [14] Asia Pacific Network of Sex Workers (APNSW), "No raids no rescues."
- [15] Asia Pacific Network of Sex Workers (APNSW), "Statement on equality now's anti-sex work campaign."
- [16] N. Kristof, "Joining in on Somaly Mam's brothel bust," *On the Ground, New York Times Opinion Pages*, vol. 12, Nov. 2011.
- [17] M. Jones, "Thailand's brothel busters," *Mother Jones*, Nov.-Dec. 2003.
- [18] Dateline NBC, "Children for sale," *NBC News*, 19 Jan. 2005.
- [19] G. Soderland, "Running from the rescuers: new U.S. crusades against sex trafficking and the rhetoric of abolition," *NWSA Journal*, vol. 17, no. 3, pp. 64-87, 2005.
- [20] G. Pheterson, *The Prostitution Prism*, Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 1996.
- [21] R. Weitzer, "The social construction of sex trafficking: ideology and institutionalization of a moral crusade," *Politics and Society*, vol. 35, no. 3, pp. 447-475, 2007.
- [22] N. Kristof, "Back to the brothel," *New York Times Op-Ed Column*, 22 Jan. 2005.
- [23] Asia Pacific Network of Sex Workers (APNSW), "Don't talk to me about sewing machine," 23 May 2007.
- [24] N. Surendranath, "Rehabilitation of trafficking victims: NGO shows the way," *The Hindu*, 30 Sept. 2013.
- [25] S. U. Mankikar, "State panel to visit mankhurd women's home," *Hindustan Times*, 9 Nov. 2012.
- [26] *HC Inquiry Bears Out Mirror Report on Mankhurd Horror Home*, Mumbai Mirror, 27 Nov. 2012.
- [27] Durbar Mahila Samanwaya Committee (DMSC), "Welcome to durbar," 2013.
- [28] Asia Pacific Network of Sex Workers (APNSW), "Somaly Uh Uh!" 17 Dec. 2010.



Anelynda E. Mielke is a PhD student at Carleton University in Ottawa, Ontario, Canada. Her field of study is sociology with a focus on visual culture and portrayal of victimhood in humanitarian efforts. She has an honors specialization bachelor of arts in political science from the University of Western Ontario in London, Ontario, Canada and a master of theological studies in Urban and International Development from Wycliffe College at the University of Toronto in Toronto, Ontario, Canada. She was born in Ontario, Canada.

She is currently employed as a research assistant with the Government of Canada in Ottawa, Ontario, Canada. She is also a teaching assistant in statistics at Carleton University. She previously worked in the humanitarian sector. She lived and worked in the Gambia, West Africa as a research and communications intern during her master's degree and worked for a humanitarian organization in Mumbai, India for 11 months in 2012-2013. She is pursuing further research on the portrayal of suffering in the media with a focus on how humanitarians perceive their own roles in depicting victimhood to foreign audiences.

Ms. Mielke was awarded departmental funding at Carleton University as well as a graduate travel and research bursary to carry out her current work. All opinions expressed in this paper are solely her own and do not necessarily reflect the viewpoints of any organization she previously worked for or those of her colleagues in other capacities.